Guidance for Evaluating Traffic Safety Culture Strategies

March 22, 2021 | 11 am (MT)

Professor Nicholas Ward, Director, Center for Health and Safety Culture
Professor Eric Austin, MPA Coordinator, Department of Political Science
Jay Otto, Researcher, Center for Health and Safety Culture
Sponsor

Traffic Safety Culture Transportation Pooled Fund Program

Participating States
Phase 1 - CA, CT, IA, ID, IL, IN, LA, MT, NH, NV, TX, UT, VT, WA
Phase 2 - CA, CT, GA, IA, ID, KS, KY, LA, MI, MN, MS, MT, NV, TX, UT, VT, WA

Managed by
Montana Department of Transportation
Sue Sillick (ssillick@mt.gov)

About Webex

📢 This webinar is being recorded and will be available on our YouTube Channel.

Join the audio either by phone or computer. Click on the phone icon at the bottom to connect audio.

Use the chat box to send questions. Please send questions to both panelists and host.
About the Center for Health and Safety Culture

We are an interdisciplinary center serving communities and organizations through research, training, and guidance to cultivate healthy and safe cultures.
Core Issues

- Traffic Safety
- Substance Misuse
- Domestic Violence
- Child Wellbeing
Challenge

• To achieve zero deaths and serious injuries on our roadways, traffic safety agencies are developing and implementing new strategies to change road user culture

• However, evaluation of these strategies is lagging

• Lack of consensus about evaluating strategies to change culture
Purpose

> Conduct a comprehensive systematic review of available evaluations of traffic safety culture initiatives

> Conduct a parallel examination of what is known about formative and summative designs used to evaluate culture change initiatives in other fields

> Provide guidance for practitioners on best practices to evaluate traffic culture strategies
Agenda

• Findings from review of literature
  – What we learned about designs
  – What outcomes were identified
  – What was lacking

• Evaluative thinking

• Questions and conclude
Research Design: Data Collection, Screening and Analysis

Systematic Analysis

- **Identification**
  - Traffic Safety Culture Records (n=19)
  - Safety Culture Records (n=100)
  - Culture Change Records (n=133)

**Screening**
- Titles and Abstracts Screened (n=252)
- Records Excluded (n=87)

- Records After Duplicates Removed (n=161)

**Final Sample**
- Full-text Records Reviewed (n=161)
- Full-text Records Excluded (n=102)
- Studies Included in the Systematic Analysis (n=59)
Findings

• Few studies specifically focused on transportation safety culture
• Diverse designs – ranging from experimental to impressionistic
  • Quasi-experimental, single-group mixed methods and qualitative were the most common
• Diverse output and outcome indicators
  • Program outcomes – e.g. patient health or well-being, accident frequency
  • “Intervening” outcomes – e.g. beliefs, attitudes or behaviors that lead to program outcomes
  • Largely positive effects
• Few studies identified specific theoretical frameworks or grounding
  • Models of culture, elements (variables), and relationships
Implications

• Pervasive evidence that culture-based interventions have positive effects

• Pragmatic designs and research strategies – reflecting audiences, needs and capacity

• Lack of clear theoretical grounding may have operational consequences
  • Without a clear theory or model, it’s difficult to measure – or operationalize – culture in support of an effective intervention
  • Integration of that model as a reflective component of operations, evaluation and ongoing development or refinement of the program – making the feedback loop more robust
Agenda

• Findings from review of literature
  – What we learned about designs
  – What outcomes were identified
  – What was lacking

• Evaluative thinking

• Questions and conclude
Evaluation

What do you immediately feel when you hear the word "evaluation"?
Available at:

Or Google "Guidance for Evaluating Traffic Safety Culture Strategies"
Evaluative Thinking...

• is motivated
  – by an attitude of inquisitiveness and
  – a belief in the value of the evidence,

• involves skills such as
  – identifying **assumptions**, 
  – posing **thoughtful questions**, 
  – pursuing deeper understanding through **reflection and perspective-taking**, and
  – making **informed decisions** in preparation for action

Evaluative Thinking & Strategies

- Values
- Attitudes & Beliefs
- Willingness & Intention
- Behavior

Strategy/Countermeasure → Beliefs Change → Behaviors Change → Crashes Change → Traffic Safety Improves
Kinds of Evaluations

• Process Evaluation
• Outcome Evaluation
• Impact Evaluation
Evaluative Thinking & Strategies

**Strategy**
Beliefs Change
Behaviors Change
Crashes Change
Traffic Safety Improves

**Evaluative Thinking**
- identifying assumptions
- posing thoughtful questions
- pursuing deeper understanding through reflection and perspective-taking
- making informed decisions in preparation for action

**Process Evaluation**
- Was the strategy implemented as it was designed?
- Did the strategy reach the intended audience?
Evaluative Thinking & Strategies

Evaluative Thinking
• identifying assumptions
• posing thoughtful questions
• pursuing deeper understanding through reflection and perspective-taking
• making informed decisions in preparation for action

Outcome Evaluation
• Did the changes intended by the strategy occur?
• Did beliefs change? Did that lead to changes in behavior?
Evaluative Thinking & Strategies

Evaluative Thinking
- identifying assumptions
- posing thoughtful questions
- pursuing deeper understanding through reflection and perspective-taking
- making informed decisions in preparation for action

Impact Evaluation
- Did the changes in behavior lead to better consequences?
- Were there unintended consequences?
Reflection Questions

Evaluative Thinking
- identifying assumptions
- posing thoughtful questions
- pursuing deeper understanding through reflection and perspective-taking
- making informed decisions in preparation for action

• How does this change your thinking about evaluation?
• How does this change your thinking about what you can do in your role?
Pooled Fund Research Project

- Final Report
- Guidance Document
- Summary "Poster"

Other Pooled Fund Research Projects

• Key Information for Driving Under the Influence of Cannabis (DUIC)
• Primer on Traffic Safety Culture
• Primer on Proactive Traffic Safety

Other Pooled Fund Research Projects

Research Underway

• Guidance on Messaging to Avoid Reactance and Moral Disengagement
• Tools and Resources to Increase Engaged Driving

Sponsor
Traffic Safety Culture Transportation Pooled Fund Program
Participating States
Phase 1- CA, CT, IA, ID, IL, IN, LA, MT, NH, NV, TX, UT, VT, WA
Phase 2- CA, CT, GA, IA, ID, KS, KY, LA, MI, MN, MS, MT, NV, TX, UT, VT, WA

Managed by
Montana Department of Transportation
Sue Sillick (ssillick@mt.gov)
Contact Us

Email: mail@chsculture.org
Phone: (406) 994-7873

#CHSCulture

Join our email list for announcements on upcoming events!

www.chsculture.org

Thank you!